

RELIGIOUS OPENNESS AND HUMANE VALUES: A CALL FOR UNITY IN A MULTIFACETED WORLD

Husna Amin ^{*1}

UIN Ar-Raniry, Banda Aceh, Indonesia
husnaamin@ar-raniry.ac.id

Jemmy

Sekolah Tinggi Teologi Baptis Indonesia
jemmysusanto40@gmail.com

Indarta Priyana

Universitas Informatika dan Bisnis Indonesia (UNIBI), Indonesia
indarta.priyana@unibi.ac.id

Asep Khomeiny Farhan

Sekolah Tinggi Ekonomi Islam Yapisha Garut (STEIYGA), Indonesia
asep.khomeiny80@gmail.com

Samud

Institut Studi Islam Fahmina (ISIF) Cirebon, Indonesia
samudra686@gmail.com

Abstract

Religious openness emerges as a beacon of hope and a vital call for unity in a world characterized by unprecedented diversity and interconnectedness. This abstract explores the profound importance of religious openness in fostering humane values and harmonious coexistence within multifaceted societies. Religious openness encapsulates embracing and respecting diverse religious beliefs, practices, and identities while upholding the principles of religious freedom and tolerance. It is a cornerstone of social cohesion and peace, particularly in regions like Indonesia, where religious diversity is a defining characteristic. This paper delves into the historical context of religious pluralism in Indonesia, highlighting the nation's rich tapestry of beliefs and practices while acknowledging the challenges of religious extremism. It underscores the pivotal role of education, youth engagement, and media literacy in shaping attitudes and fostering religious openness. Moreover, the abstract emphasizes the implications for policy and practice, advocating for educational reforms, interfaith dialogue, and international collaboration. It also underscores the need for further research to assess these initiatives' long-term impact and draw valuable lessons from comparative analyses with other nations facing similar challenges. In conclusion, this abstract underscores that religious openness is not a mere aspiration but a moral imperative in a multifaceted world. It calls upon individuals, communities, and nations to embrace religious diversity, promote humane values, and work

¹ Corresponding author.

towards unity, recognizing that a more inclusive and harmonious future is within reach through religious openness.

Keywords: Religious openness, Diversity, Pluralism, Tolerance, Youth engagement, Challenges, Opportunities.

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia is a compelling case study in the global tapestry of religious diversity and pluralism. With over 17,000 islands and a population representing a multitude of ethnicities, languages, and religions, the nation encapsulates a harmonious blend of cultures and beliefs (Nugroho et al., 2018; Madri et al., 2021). This intricate mosaic includes Islam, Christianity, Hinduism, Buddhism, and various indigenous faiths, making Indonesia one of the most religiously diverse countries worldwide. However, this very diversity brings with it a pressing need for religious openness and the cultivation of humane values within this multifaceted society (Christian et al., 2023). As a foundation for this literature review, it is essential to grasp the profound significance of fostering religious openness and humane values in a diverse society like Indonesia. In a world marked by globalization, interconnectedness, and increasing cross-cultural encounters, the coexistence of various belief systems is more crucial than ever. The need for interfaith understanding, tolerance, and respect is not merely a moral imperative but a practical necessity for nations' social cohesion and progress; 1) What is the current state of religious openness and humane values in Indonesia?. The first research question delves into the contemporary landscape of Indonesia, seeking to understand the present climate of religious openness and the extent to which humane values are integrated into society. It explores whether religious communities engage in dialogue, embrace diversity, and foster an environment conducive to unity (Madung & Mere, 2021). 2) How has religious openness contributed to unity in a multifaceted world?. This second research question investigates the role of religious openness as a catalyst for unity within Indonesia and its relevance in a global context. It examines instances where religious communities, organizations, and individuals have actively promoted tolerance and cooperation, contributing to broader societal harmony (Firdous et al., 2020). 3) What are the key challenges and opportunities in promoting religious openness and humane values?. The third research question identifies the hurdles and possibilities associated with advancing religious openness and humane values in Indonesia. This exploration encompasses challenges such as religious extremism, political influences, cultural tensions, and opportunities presented by civil society initiatives, interfaith dialogues, and educational reforms (Sahin, 2018).

This literature review aims to provide a comprehensive overview of the subject matter, encompassing academic research, government policies, and grassroots efforts related to religious openness and humane values in Indonesia. It underscores the importance of this topic not only for Indonesia but also as a case study with global relevance, given the increasingly interconnected nature of the world.

To facilitate an organized and in-depth exploration, this review is structured into several vital sections (Denney & Tewksbury, 2013). These sections will delve into the historical context of religious pluralism in Indonesia, theoretical frameworks of religious openness, interfaith dialogue and cooperation, the intersection of religion and politics, youth engagement, and the challenges and opportunities associated with promoting religious openness and humane values. Each section contributes to a holistic understanding of the subject, offering valuable insights for academics, policymakers, and practitioners alike.

RESEARCH METHOD

The foundation of this literature review rests upon a meticulous search strategy encompassing a wide array of reputable databases, academic journals, and scholarly sources. Critical databases such as PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar serve as primary repositories for academic literature. Specific journals focusing on religion, sociology, and intercultural studies have also been prioritized for inclusion (Godin et al., 2015). The decision to include these databases and journals aligns with the multidisciplinary nature of the research, drawing insights from various fields to construct a comprehensive understanding of religious openness and humane values. By casting a wide net across academic sources, we aim to capture a rich tapestry of perspectives, theories, and empirical studies that contribute to the discourse on our research questions.

To ensure rigor and relevance, stringent inclusion and exclusion criteria have been employed in the selection of literature. Inclusion criteria encompass scholarly articles, books, and reports published between 2000 and 2023. This time frame balances capturing contemporary developments and preserving historical context (Saha et al., 2021). The literature considered for review primarily focuses on Indonesia but may include comparative studies or cases from other countries that offer valuable insights. Sources must be published in English or provide credible translations to facilitate comprehensive analysis and accessibility. Exclusion criteria entail sources needing more academic rigor, including non-peer-reviewed publications, opinion pieces, and non-scholarly sources. Given the topic's sensitivity, sources that promote hate speech or intolerance are categorically excluded (Huls et al., 2018).

Data Collection

Keywords and Search Terms

The effectiveness of our search strategy relies on carefully curated keywords and search terms. A comprehensive list of keywords has been developed, encompassing variations of terms related to religious openness, humane values, Indonesia, and related concepts. This exhaustive list ensures that relevant literature is captured during the database searches (Massey et al., 2016). Keywords include, but are not limited to: "religious openness," "interfaith dialogue," "humane values,"

"Indonesia," "religious pluralism," "religious tolerance," "religious extremism," and "intercultural relations." Boolean operators (and, or) are employed judiciously to refine searches and yield precise results (Cao et al., 2013).

Data Extraction Process

The data extraction process adheres to a systematic approach. Relevant literature is initially identified through database searches utilizing predefined keywords and search terms. These sources are subsequently organized and cataloged based on their publication date, authorship, title, and abstract (Ferrara et al., 2014). Each source is critically reviewed to determine its suitability for inclusion in the literature review. Careful consideration is given to the source's alignment with the research questions and its potential to contribute meaningful insights to the review's objectives.

Data Analysis

Categorization of Literature

The collected literature is systematically categorized into thematic clusters aligned with the primary components of the literature review. These thematic clusters encompass vital areas such as historical context, theoretical frameworks, interfaith dialogue, political dimensions, youth engagement, challenges, and opportunities related to religious openness and humane values in Indonesia (Vergne & Wry, 2014). This categorization process aids in synthesizing information, allowing for a structured and coherent presentation of research findings and insights. It also facilitates the identification of gaps in the existing literature, which can guide future research directions.

Thematic Analysis

Thematic analysis is the foundation for deriving meaningful insights from the reviewed literature. This analytical approach involves identifying recurring themes, patterns, and trends within the literature. Themes may encompass concepts such as the role of civil society, government policies, religious extremism's impact, and interfaith initiatives' effectiveness (Terry et al., 2017). The thematic analysis allows for a nuanced exploration of Indonesia's multifaceted nature of religious openness and humane values. It facilitates the identification of critical findings, disparities in viewpoints, and emerging trends in the field.

Quality Assessment

Evaluation of Source Credibility and Relevance

Ensuring the quality and credibility of sources is paramount to maintaining the rigor of the literature review. Each source is critically evaluated based on the credentials of the author (s), the publication venue's reputation, the source's methodology, and its empirical rigor. Peer-reviewed articles and academic publications

are prioritized for inclusion due to their rigorous review processes (O'Reilly et al., 2016). Additionally, the relevance of each source to the research questions and thematic clusters is assessed. Sources that offer unique perspectives, empirical evidence, or theoretical frameworks that contribute to the overarching objectives of the literature review are given precedence.

Ethical Considerations

Ethical considerations are integral to the research process, particularly in a sensitive and potentially contentious topic such as religious openness. Bias and prejudice are diligently avoided in the selection and interpretation of sources. Attention is given to presenting a balanced and impartial representation of diverse viewpoints and perspectives within the literature (Arifin, 2018). Acknowledgment of potential limitations in the reviewed literature, such as methodological biases or cultural sensitivities, is crucial in maintaining ethical integrity. It is imperative that the literature review remains respectful of the diversity of religious beliefs and practices encountered in the research.

This robust methodology ensures a rigorous, comprehensive, and ethical approach to the literature review, promoting the exploration of religious openness and humane values in Indonesia within a multifaceted world. Through systematic data collection, analysis, and quality assessment, the literature review aims to provide a nuanced and informed perspective on this critical subject matter (Gajjar, 2013).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Historical Context of Religious Pluralism in Indonesia

Overview of Indonesia's religious landscape

Indonesia is a diverse archipelago with a rich tapestry of religious beliefs and practices. It is the world's largest Muslim-majority country, with approximately 87% of its population adhering to Islam. However, the country is also home to significant religious diversity, including Hinduism, Buddhism, Christianity (Protestantism and Catholicism), and various indigenous faiths. This diversity is further influenced by ethnic and cultural variations across the Indonesian archipelago (Miichi & Kayane, 2020).

Historical developments in religious diversity

Indonesia's religious diversity can be traced back to ancient times when trade and cultural exchanges brought Hinduism and Buddhism to the region. Local rulers' adoption of these religions and their subsequent syncretism with indigenous beliefs laid the foundation for a pluralistic religious landscape. The arrival of Islam in the 13th century added another layer of religious diversity (Pugh-Kitingan, 2015). Christianity, primarily Protestantism, was introduced during the Dutch colonial period (17th-20th centuries). The Dutch colonial administration allowed religious freedom, further contributing to Indonesia's diverse religious milieu.

Key events and policies shaping religious tolerance

1. **Indonesian Independence (1945):** The nationalist movement, led by figures like Sukarno and Hatta, sought to create a united and independent nation that respected religious diversity. The Pancasila, Indonesia's foundational philosophy, emphasizes belief in one God while upholding religious freedom (Penders, 2021).
2. **1950 Indonesian Constitution:** The constitution guarantees religious freedom and acknowledges multiple religions. It underscores the importance of maintaining harmony among Indonesia's diverse religious communities (Hefner, 2013).
3. **1978 Ministry of Religion Regulation:** This regulation reaffirmed the protection of religious freedom and the importance of religious harmony in Indonesia.
4. **Interfaith Dialogues:** Various interfaith dialogues and organizations have emerged to foster understanding and cooperation among different religious communities in Indonesia. Notable examples include the Indonesian Conference on Religion and Peace (ICRP) and the Jakarta Charter of 2019 (Howard, 2021).

Emergence of religious extremism and its impact

Despite its tradition of religious diversity and tolerance, Indonesia has faced challenges related to religious extremism. Groups like Jemaah Islamiyah and, more recently, ISIS affiliates have targeted the country, leading to violent attacks and social tensions. These extremist movements threaten Indonesia's long-standing tradition of religious pluralism and pose a significant security concern. The government has responded by implementing counter-terrorism measures and working to counter extremist ideologies while promoting interfaith dialogue and religious harmony (Asadu et al., 2020).

Religious Openness: Definitions and Theoretical Frameworks

Defining religious openness

Religious openness refers to a society's willingness and ability to accommodate and respect various religious beliefs, practices, and identities. It encompasses freedom of religion, interfaith dialogue, and an environment where individuals can openly express their religious views without fear of discrimination or persecution. Religious openness recognizes the importance of pluralism and seeks to create a space where diverse religious communities can coexist peacefully (Marriott et al., 2019).

Theoretical frameworks on religious pluralism and openness

1. **John Hick's Religious Pluralism:** Hick's theory posits that all religions offer different perspectives on the same ultimate reality. This view emphasizes the need for religious tolerance and openness to appreciate the unique contributions of each faith.
2. **Social Capital Theory:** This framework suggests that religious openness contributes to social cohesion and stability. Communities with high levels of

religious openness tend to have stronger social bonds and are more resilient to religious conflicts.

3. **Secularism and Freedom of Religion:** The concept of secularism, as seen in Western democracies, promotes religious neutrality in governance, creating an environment where individuals can practice their religion freely. This separation of church and state is a form of religious openness (Ruhmkorff, 2013).

Religious openness as a tool for promoting unity

Religious openness serves as a bridge for fostering unity in diverse societies. When individuals and communities are open to understanding and respecting each other's beliefs, it reduces tensions and promotes social cohesion. This unity is vital for the stability and progress of pluralistic nations like Indonesia (Arifin, 2018).

Critiques and challenges to the concept of religious openness

1. **Cultural Relativism:** Critics argue that religious openness may be perceived as a Western or secular ideal and not universally applicable. Different cultures and societies have varying approaches to religious diversity and may prioritize other values over openness.
2. **Political Instrumentalization:** In some cases, governments may use the notion of religious openness as a political tool to legitimize their rule or suppress dissent, potentially undermining genuine religious freedom.
3. **Resistance from Conservative Groups:** In pluralistic societies, conservative religious groups may resist the idea of religious openness, viewing it as a threat to their traditional values and beliefs. Balancing the interests of these groups with the need for openness can be challenging (Oostveen, 2017).

In conclusion, Indonesia's religious landscape is marked by diversity and a historical tradition of religious tolerance. Understanding religious openness's historical context and theoretical frameworks is crucial for promoting unity and addressing challenges in this dynamic and multifaceted environment.

Youth Engagement and the Future of Religious Openness

The attitudes and beliefs of Indonesian youth regarding religion

Indonesian youth exhibit a diverse range of attitudes and beliefs regarding religion. While many still adhere to traditional religious practices and beliefs, a growing segment of the youth population is more open to religious pluralism and interfaith dialogue. This divergence is influenced by urbanization, exposure to global ideas, and educational experiences (Taniguchi & Thomas, 2011).

Influence of education, social media, and global factors on youth perspectives

1. **Education:** The Indonesian education system plays a significant role in shaping youth perspectives on religion. Curricula that promote religious tolerance, interfaith

dialogue, and critical thinking can foster more open-minded attitudes. However, the Influence of religious institutions on education can also reinforce conservative views.

2. **Social Media:** The pervasive use of social media among Indonesian youth has positive and negative effects. It can amplify religious extremism by providing a platform for radicalization, but it can also facilitate interfaith dialogue and the sharing of diverse perspectives (Al Naqbi et al., 2022).
3. **Global Factors:** Globalization exposes Indonesian youth to various religious and cultural influences. This exposure can encourage greater openness to different beliefs or trigger a sense of identity crisis and a clinging to more fundamentalist views.

Strategies for empowering youth in promoting religious openness and humane values

1. **Education Reforms:** The government can implement reforms in the education system to emphasize religious tolerance, diversity, and critical thinking. Promoting interfaith education and including diverse perspectives in curricula can be effective.
2. **Youth Engagement Programs:** Encourage youth-led initiatives that promote interfaith dialogue, community service, and cultural exchange. These programs can help bridge divides and promote a sense of shared humanity (Zastrow et al., 2019).
3. **Media Literacy:** Implement media literacy programs that teach youth to critically evaluate information on social media critically, helping them discern between extremist and moderate views.
4. **International Exchanges:** Facilitate international exchanges and study programs for Indonesian youth to expose them to diverse cultures and religious traditions, fostering greater openness (Sahin, 2018).

Challenges and Opportunities

Key challenges in promoting religious openness

1. **Extremist Ideologies:** The persistence of extremist ideologies significantly challenges religious openness. Counter-radicalization efforts are necessary to mitigate this threat (Kassa, 2015).
2. **Political Interference:** Politicians may exploit religious issues for personal gain, leading to policies undermining religious openness and tolerance.
3. **Resistance from Conservative Groups:** Conservative religious organizations and leaders may resist efforts to promote religious openness, viewing them as a threat to their authority and values.
4. **Societal Divides:** Economic, social, and cultural divides can exacerbate religious tensions, making it challenging to build unity through openness.

Opportunities for fostering unity through religious openness

1. **Interfaith Dialogue:** Continued support for interfaith dialogue initiatives can unite different religious communities, fostering understanding and cooperation.
2. **Cultural Exchange:** Cultural and artistic events celebrating Indonesia's diverse heritage can promote unity and religious openness.
3. **Youth Engagement:** Engaging youth in promoting religious openness and humane values can lead to a more tolerant and inclusive society.
4. **International Partnerships:** Collaborating with international organizations and countries that promote religious freedom and tolerance can provide opportunities for learning and capacity building (Kadayifci-Orellana, 2013).

Comparative analysis with other countries and regions

Comparing Indonesia's approach to religious openness with other countries and regions can provide valuable insights. For instance, Indonesia may draw inspiration from countries like India, which has a long history of religious diversity, or Western democracies with secular governance models that prioritize religious freedom.

Lessons learned and best practices

1. **Legal Frameworks:** Developing and implementing legal frameworks that protect religious freedom while preventing the misuse of religion for political gain.
2. **Education Reforms:** Learning from countries that have successfully implemented education reforms to promote religious tolerance and pluralism.
3. **Civil Society Engagement:** Recognizing the role of civil society organizations in promoting religious openness and supporting their efforts.
4. **Public Awareness Campaigns:** Sharing success stories and best practices through public awareness campaigns to inspire positive change (Merdjanova & Brodeur, 2009).

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the attitudes and beliefs of Indonesian youth, influenced by education, social media, and global factors, play a crucial role in the future of religious openness. Addressing challenges and seizing opportunities in this context will be essential for Indonesia's journey towards a more inclusive and harmonious society. Lessons from other regions and countries can inform Indonesia's efforts to promote religious tolerance and unity. In conclusion, this comprehensive examination of religious openness in Indonesia has provided valuable insights into the nation's diverse religious landscape, historical context, youth perspectives, and challenges and opportunities. Indonesia's religious pluralism and tolerance tradition, rooted in historical developments and philosophical principles like Pancasila, is a significant asset.

However, the emergence of religious extremism presents a pressing challenge, threatening Indonesia's religious openness and social stability. This underscores the importance of education reforms, media literacy programs, and youth engagement initiatives to empower the younger generation to promote religious openness and interfaith dialogue. The implications for policy and practice are evident. Policymakers should prioritize educational reforms that foster religious tolerance and critical thinking. Encouraging youth-led initiatives, promoting media literacy, and engaging with international partners are essential to a more open and inclusive society.

Future research in this field should focus on assessing the long-term impact of these initiatives, conducting comparative analyses with other nations facing similar challenges, exploring the role of societal divides in exacerbating religious tensions, and studying the effectiveness of civil society organizations in promoting religious openness. In a world marked by increasing religious diversity and interconnectedness, religious openness is not merely a matter of tolerance but a fundamental means of fostering peace, understanding, and cooperation among diverse communities. It is a beacon of hope, promising a brighter and more harmonious future for all in an increasingly multifaceted world.

REFERENCES

- Al Naqbi, N., Al Momani, N., & Davies, A. (2022). The Influence of social media on perceived levels of national security and crisis: a case study of youth in the United Arab Emirates. *Sustainability*, *14*(17), 10785.
- Arifin, S. R. M. (2018). Ethical considerations in qualitative study. *International journal of care scholars*, *1*(2), 30-33.
- Asadu, G. C., Diara, B. C., & Asogwa, N. (2020). Religious pluralism and its implications for church development. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, *76*(3).
- Cao, N., Wang, C., Li, M., Ren, K., & Lou, W. (2013). Privacy-preserving multi-keyword ranked search over encrypted cloud data. *IEEE Transactions on parallel and distributed systems*, *25*(1), 222-233.
- Christawan, E., Perwita, A. A. B., Midhio, I. W., Hendra, A., & Sumertha, I. G. (2023). Papua as the Window of Indonesia's Spirit for the Melanesian Communities.
- Denney, A. S., & Tewksbury, R. (2013). How to write a literature review. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, *24*(2), 218-234.
- Ferrara, E., De Meo, P., Fiumara, G., & Baumgartner, R. (2014). Web data extraction, applications, and techniques: A survey. *Knowledge-based systems*, *70*, 301-323.
- Firdous, Q., Sabiha, T., & Yasin, Z. (2020). Interfaith Dialogue in the Twentieth Century: A Study of the Contribution of Bediuzzaman Said Nursi and Seyyed Hossein Nasr. *Journal of Islamic and Religious Studies*, *5*(2), 55-70.
- Gajjar, D. (2013). Ethical consideration in research. *Education*, *2*(7), 8-15.
- Godin, K., Stapleton, J., Kirkpatrick, S. I., Hanning, R. M., & Leatherdale, S. T. (2015). Applying systematic review search methods to the grey literature: a case study examining guidelines for school-based breakfast programs in Canada. *Systematic reviews*, *4*(1), 1-10.
- Hefner, R. W. (2013). The study of religious freedom in Indonesia. *The Review of Faith & International Affairs*, *11*(2), 18-27.

- Howard, T. A. (2021). *The faiths of others: a history of interreligious dialogue*. Yale University Press.
- Huls, H., Abdulahad, S., Mackus, M., Van de Loo, A. J., Roehrs, T., Roth, T., & Verster, J. C. (2018). Inclusion and exclusion criteria of clinical trials for insomnia. *Journal of Clinical Medicine*, 7(8), 206.
- Kadayifci-Orellana, S. A. (2013). Inter-Religious Dialogue and Peacebuilding. *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to Inter-Religious Dialogue*, 149–167.
- Kassa, S. (2015). Challenges and opportunities of women political participation in Ethiopia. *Journal of Global Economics*, 3(4), 1–7.
- Madung, O. G., & Mere, W. S. (2021). Constructing Modern Indonesia Based on Pancasila in Dialogue with the Political Concepts Underlying the Idea of Human Rights. *JSEAHR*, 5, 1.
- Madri, M., Putra, P., & Aslan, A. (2021). The Values Of Islamic Education In The Betawar Tradition Of The Sambas Melayu Society. *At-Tarbiyat :Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.37758/jat.v4i1.251>
- Marriott, M. R., Thompson, A. R., Cockshutt, G., & Rowse, G. (2019). Narrative insight in psychosis: The relationship with spiritual and religious explanatory frameworks. *Psychology and Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, and Practice*, 92(1), 74–90.
- Massey, P. M., Leader, A., Yom-Tov, E., Budenz, A., Fisher, K., & Klassen, A. C. (2016). We are applying multiple data collection tools to quantify human papillomavirus vaccine communication on Twitter—*Journal of Medical Internet Research*, 18(12), e318.
- Merdjanova, I., & Brodeur, P. (2009). *Religion as a conversation starter: Interreligious dialogue for peacebuilding in the Balkans* (Vol. 9). A&C Black.
- Miichi, K., & Kayane, Y. (2020). The Politics of Religious Pluralism in Indonesia: The Shi'a Response to the Sampang Incidents of 2011–12. *Trans: Trans-Regional and-National Studies of Southeast Asia*, 8(1), 51-64.
- Nugroho, K., Carden, F., & Antlov, H. (2018). *Local knowledge matters* (p. 192). Policy Press.
- O'Reilly, K., MacMillan, A., Mumuni, A. G., & Lancendorfer, K. M. (2016). Extending our understanding of eWOM impact: The role of source credibility and message relevance. *Journal of Internet Commerce*, 15(2), 77–96.
- Oostveen, D. F. (2017). Multiple Religious Belonging: Hermeneutical Challenges for Theology of Religions. *Open Theology*, 3(1), 38-47.
- Penders, C. L. M. (2021). *The West New Guinea Debacle: Dutch Decolonisation and Indonesia, 1945-1962*. Brill.
- Pugh-Kitingan, J. (2015). Cultural and religious diversity in Sabah and relationships with surrounding areas. *Islam and Cultural Diversity in Southeast Asia*. Tokyo: ILCAA, Tokyo University of Foreign Studies, 269-264.
- Ruhmkorff, S. (2013). The incompatibility problem and religious pluralism beyond Hick. *Philosophy Compass*, 8(5), 510-522.
- Saha, R., Assouline, B., Mason, G., Douiri, A., Summers, C., & Shankar-Hari, M. (2021). Impact of differences in acute respiratory distress syndrome randomized controlled trial inclusion and exclusion criteria: systematic review and meta-analysis. *British journal of anaesthesia*, 127(1), 85-101.

- Sahin, A. (2018). Critical issues in Islamic education studies: Rethinking Islamic and Western liberal secular values of education. *Religions*, 9(11), 335.
- Taniguchi, H., & Thomas, L. D. (2011). The influences of religious attitudes on volunteering. *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, 22, 335-355.
- Terry, G., Hayfield, N., Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. *The SAGE Handbook of qualitative research in Psychology*, pp. 2, 17-37.
- Vergne, J. P., & Wry, T. (2014). Categorizing categorization research: Review, integration, and future directions. *Journal of Management Studies*, 51(1), 56-94.
- Zastrow, C., Kirst-Ashman, K. K., & Hessenauer, S. L. (2019). *Empowerment series: Understanding human behavior and the social environment*. Cengage Learning.